

**Argentina: PTF impact review**  
**Projects on transparency and information**

- I Introduction
- II Cluster overview
- III Project impact
- IV Some lessons
- V Conclusion
- Annex 1
- Annex 2
- References

Björn Wellenius  
11 September 2012

## I Introduction

The Partnership for Transparency Fund (PTF) reviewed in 2012 the impact of 10 projects on transparency and information supported in Argentina between 2004 and 2011. Seven projects were supported by grants from Fondo Regional para la Promoción de la Transparencia (FONTRA) and three directly by PTF grants, a total of USD 0.2 million.<sup>1</sup>

This review assessed the impact of the projects beyond specific activities and results obtained during project execution. Final project reports by the grantees and independent evaluations of the projects supported by FONTRA indicated that most of the projects by and large carried out the activities and obtained the specific results expected at the onset. But they said less or nothing about whether this mattered in the longer run and from the broader viewpoint of improving governance, increasing civil society participation, and reducing opportunity for corruption. The review sought to narrow that gap and also draw some lessons that may be applicable to future PTF work in this area and in Argentina.

The impact assessment was based on examining all documents on the 10 projects available in PTF and FONTRA online files, limited search of some grantee web sites, and discussion with officials of the grantee organizations and others. Based on the file and web site reviews, a one-page brief on each project was prepared, which summarized the project's objectives, activities, results, impact, and overall assessment. The project briefs were sent to the respective grantees, who were invited to discuss and mark up the brief, provide additional information, and suggest external contacts familiar with the project. Four of the six grantee organizations, accounting for eight of the ten projects and 84 percent of the total grant amount, responded favorably and led to substantial discussions by telephone and Skype,

---

<sup>1</sup> This report on transparency and information projects was prepared by Björn Wellenius between May and September 2012, without field visits. Thirteen other projects, dealing with public policy and procurement, were reviewed by Miguel Schloss and Santiago Friedman, who visited Argentina in March 2012. The classification of projects into these three clusters was solely for the purpose of allocating responsibilities among reviewers, and is to some extent arbitrary.

additional documentation, and marked-up project briefs. The final versions of the 10 project briefs are in PTF files, as is additional material sent by grantees.

## II Cluster overview

Projects in this cluster mainly aimed at improving access to public information, and to some extent also enhancing transparency and governance more generally. Project scope, activities, and results varied widely, while project cost, financing, and duration were in a narrower range. A mix of small and large NGOs implemented the projects at the federal and provincial levels.

### Project scope

Six of the ten projects in this cluster dealt with access to public information. Of these, five projects helped launch or improve implementation of recent federal, provincial, or municipal rules on access to public information. At the federal level, one project (number 7 in Annex 1) assessed the initial implementation of a government decree on the regulation of access to public information and how it could be improved in five ministries. At the provincial level, two projects (9, 10) helped launch implementation of a government decree regulating the access to public information in the province of Santa Fe. Another project (4) built up pressure on the governments of the province of Córdoba and several municipalities to disclose information on public sector procurement. In the region of Patagonia, the project (6) worked with the governments of two provinces and three cities to enable citizens and the media to fight corruption by applying existing rules.<sup>2</sup> The sixth project (3), in contrast, sought to overcome old laws and established practice in the judiciary that kept secret all information on corruption cases being processed.

The other four projects in this cluster related more broadly to the quest for transparency and good governance. At the federal level, projects sought to improve external control of government agencies through auditing (1) and monitored compliance with campaign finance

---

<sup>2</sup> Tierra del Fuego and Rio Negro (two of the four provinces of Patagonia in Argentina), Bariloche and Viedma (cities in Rio Negro), and Ushuaia (city in Tierra del Fuego).

provisions of recent legislation on electoral reform (8). At the regional level, a project aimed at strengthening SMEs in Buenos Aires to fight bribery in public sector procurement (2). And in the province of Formosa, one project sought to help firms become good corporate citizens through tax compliance, fair competition, and social responsibility (5).

### Activities

Each project carried out one or more of the following activities in pursuit of their objectives:

- *Awareness raising* Most projects (60 percent) used media campaigns, press coverage, bulletins, web sites, or blogs to raise awareness of civil society (e.g. community leaders, students, journalists) on public policy issues (e.g. the right and means to access public information) and mobilize participation (e.g. citizen engagement against corruption).
- *Capacity building* Several projects (30 percent) conducted seminars, workshops, and training courses to build capacity in civil society (e.g. to apply for and use information from government agencies in connection with priority community concerns) and in government agencies and public sector enterprises (e.g. handle requests for information).
- *Performance review* At the core of one-half of the projects were efforts to review and analyze the functions and performance of public sector agencies in complying with existing laws and decrees at the federal and provincial levels.
- *Recommendations and advocacy* Most projects (80 percent) recommended improvements of existing practices, normative frameworks, or their implementation, and advocated for these changes among civil society, government, or the legislature.
- *Dissemination* Most projects (60 percent) placed emphasis on disseminating results, including case studies, resource guides, and training material developed during the project.

- *Other* Activities under some projects included reviewing regional experience (on electoral reform in Latin America), providing technical and legal advice (to SMEs), monitoring the media (campaign advertising), launching and testing procedures (obtain public information, appeal to the judiciary), and creating databases (court cases on corruption).

## Results

These project activities led to one or more of the following results:

- *Civil society participation* One-half of the projects mobilized specific civil society groups or organizations to exercise the right to access public information or participate in initiatives to improve government in areas such as external control, procurement, and environment planning.<sup>3</sup>
- *Better government* One half of the projects resulted in participating public sector agencies publishing more information on their activities, adopting active transparency practices, improving responsiveness to requests for public information, or increasing access to civil society participation.
- *Improved normative frameworks* Several projects (40 percent) resulted in judicial decisions on civil society's right to access public information, a legal opinion on the right to public information in the context of existing laws and practices that favored secrecy, or drafting of new legislation to ensure minority party participation in a congressional commission.
- *Analytical work* Some projects (30 percent) produced reports on background research of regional experience, review and diagnostic of government agencies, or monitoring of the application of the normative framework.

---

<sup>3</sup> This count includes as part of civil society the association of SMEs but excludes the NGOs implementing the projects.

- *Resource development* One-half of all projects produced new tools for use during the project. This included a resource guide for SMEs, a policy brief and video on electoral reform, a case study on access to information in government, a database on court cases against corruption, a regional website to share information on the fight against corruption in different localities, a call center for consultation and advice, and informal networks among specific government agencies, civil society, and media.

#### Project cost, financing, and duration

The grants for projects on transparency and information ranged from USD 12,000 to USD 40,000, averaging USD 19,867. The grants accounted for 72 percent of average total project cost of USD 27,436 estimated *ex ante* in the project proposals. The balance 28 percent of estimated project cost was contributed by the grantees themselves. Project cost and grantee contribution figures, however, have only illustrative value, as they are not always readily separable from the grantees' other expenses and may have been driven to some extent by grant cofinancing requirements. This is particularly the case of projects undertaken by large organizations, whose budgets far exceed the grants and where the projects are relatively small components of broader work programs.<sup>4</sup> The projects were planned to be completed in six to 13 months, averaging nine months. No *ex-post* cost estimates were found in files. None of the grant amounts or completion dates appear to have been revised during project implementation.

---

<sup>4</sup> CIPPEC in 2011 carried out 101 projects and attracted USD 2.8 million in domestic and foreign funding. PTF's grant of 2011 for USD 40,000 amounted to 1.4 percent of total CIPPEC funds that year. The project supported by this grant was an integral part of a much larger exercise in monitoring and evaluating initial application of the electoral reform of 2009 at the national and provincial levels (CIPPEC 2012a, b) and proposing and discussing revisions of the law and its implementation (Leira and Pomares 2012).

### Implementing organizations

Six civil society organizations were the recipients of the PTF and FONTRA grants and responsible for execution of the 10 projects on transparency and information. Summary descriptions are in Annex 2.

The implementing organizations vary widely in scope, vocation, and size. Two of them operate at the national level, and are based in Buenos Aires. CIPPEC promotes public policies that enhance equity and growth. It has 48 staff and 16 volunteers, a budget of about USD 2.8m, and around 100 projects underway on a wide range of subjects. ACIJ is dedicated to defending the rights of the most disadvantaged groups of society and strengthening democracy. It has 25 staff and 14 volunteers, a budget of about USD 0.6 million, and seven projects underway. CIPPEC and ACIJ each were in charge of three projects of this cluster and together account for 68 percent of total grants.

The other four implementing organizations operate within individual provinces or cities, where they are based. FEC promotes strengthening democratic institutions and active citizen engagement in the public interest in the province of Santa Fe, and particularly in the capital city Rosario. It has about 40 volunteers and three staff, and a budget around USD 60,000. C365 and FUNDEPS, with two principals and nine associates, jointly run *Córdoba Transparente*, a program promoting access to public information, monitoring electoral processes, and raising awareness on the fight against corruption in the province of Córdoba. CEP is a one-person operation that mobilizes members of organizations in the region of Patagonia and seeks to improve the quality of public policy institutions at the provincial and local levels. And CEC-FSA is a trade union in the city of Formosa, active in worker education and job training. Each organization implemented one project of this cluster and together account for 32 percent of total grants.



### III Impact

Projects in this cluster by and large carried out the planned activities and obtained the results they were seeking. But did this make a difference beyond the projects' narrow confines and short durations?

Most projects launched or contributed to public debate on transparency and access to information, with lasting effect. Some projects can be credited with giving the first push to authorities to realize they were not meeting their obligations in terms of access to public information (project 4 in Annex 1) or supported government agencies in the critical initial stages of implementing new practices (9, 10).

For eight of the 10 projects (80 percent), specific results remained effective for two or more years after the end of the project, or contributed to change well beyond the intended project scope, or both. However, none of the initiatives or recommendations developed by the projects for subsequent implementation prospered. Tools developed during two projects (20 percent) were also used outside the project or after it was completed. And although all projects helped the grantees develop their activities, only in two cases (20 percent) did they contribute to lasting development of the grantees' capabilities. Table 3.1 summarizes project objectives and impacts.<sup>5</sup> Table 3.2 shows the distribution of categories of impact among the projects.

---

<sup>5</sup> In this report, a project has 'impact' if it contributes to better governance, enhanced civil society participation, or reduced opportunities for corruption (i) beyond its planned activities and results within the project timeframe or (ii) after project completion. This is the criterion used to separate 'impact' from 'results' in the individual project one-page summaries in files, from which table 3.1 is derived. An example of the first kind is the project in Patagonia (number 6 in the list of Annex 1), during which the debate on access to public information led the public to get involved during the project in specific government and community issues followed by government action on the environment, municipal ordinances, and other matters. An example of the second kind is the project in Córdoba (4), where launching of procedures to obtain public information led to a succession of institutional or legal changes to facilitate transparency and access to information in the provincial, city, and several municipal governments. The project in Formosa (5) is an example of a project without known impact, as taxation, ethics, and social responsibility plans of participating firms were prepared, but there is no information

< Table 3.1 >

< Table 3.2 >

### Sustainability

Results achieved by four of the 10 projects (40 percent) lasted well after the projects ended.

- Seven years after project completion, improvements in the federal auditing agency and the parliamentary commission to which it reports continue in place, as do resulting gains in transparency, effectiveness, and civil society participation in the federal government external control system (project 1 in Annex 1).
- Two years after project completion, increased transparency of procurement by two federal ministries and one state enterprise are still effective (2), a federal court ruling that civil society has a legitimate interest in accessing information on corruption cases has had lasting effect, bringing Argentina somewhat closer to meeting internationally agreed principles (3), and the government anti-corruption agency in the province of Santa Fe continues to gain effectiveness and credibility as authority and channel of access to public information (10).
- On the other hand, the project objective of getting private SMEs actively involved in the fight against corruption in public sector procurement has proven unrealistic (2), and budget constraints prevent Santa Fe's anti-corruption agency from continuing awareness campaigns on access to public information proven effective under the project (10).

---

on whether these plans were implemented and whether they made any difference in the business or labor climate.

### Implementation

Three of the 10 projects (30 percent) launched initiatives or made recommendations to be implemented after project completion. None succeeded.

- Legislation drafted with project support to enhance minority participation in the parliamentary commission that oversees the federal audit agency made no progress (1).
- Two years after project completion, an appeal to a lower court decision limiting expanded access to information on corruption cases was still pending (3).
- Recommendations to improve access to information in five ministries were not pursued in a climate of increasingly opaque federal government (7).

Scope Five of the 10 projects (50 percent) had effects well beyond their intended scope in terms of issues addressed, geographical coverage, or government agencies and civil society groups involved, either during or after the project.

- A project that failed to engage SMEs in the Buenos Aires region in the fight against bribery in public procurement actually led to increased SME market participation and greater exposure of corrupt practices to public scrutiny (2).
- The government of the province of Córdoba established a transparency portal and financial management system that provide much of the information earlier denied to NGOs, the government of the capital city established an office of public information, ordinances on access to public information were adopted in two other municipalities and are being discussed in eight more, and principles promoted by the project influenced the electoral platforms of the main parties (4).
- Debate on the right and means to access public information in two provinces and three cities in Patagonia led to government plans for protecting the coastal environment, a new city charter with provisions on access to public information, a web site where citizens can find and request municipal information throughout the region, and an ordinance on

municipal schools that gives open access to financial, recruitment, and procurement information (6).

- Dissemination of project findings on the national electoral campaign triggered unprecedented release of information by federal electoral officials and a presentation to the federal congressional committee on constitutional affairs, project lessons on campaign finance at the national level were applied to the design of electoral reforms in Buenos Aires and four provinces, and public awareness was raised on unregulated campaign use of public resources by incumbents (8).
- The government of the province of Santa Fe adopted mandatory standards of access to information for all state enterprises along the lines of project results in two enterprises, and is developing a transparency and public information portal (9).

### Tools

Several projects produced reports, case studies, and other results that were disseminated to some extent beyond the immediate project participants, in some cases at a wider national or regional level. Tools developed by two of the 10 projects (20 percent) are known to have been used beyond the projects. A case study and some training, practice, and dissemination material continued to be in use after the end of the projects (9, 10). A case study and active transparency plan developed during a project were used in two later training programs and as models for internal use by the grantee (9).

### Grantee development

Two of the 10 projects (20 percent) contributed significantly to development of the grantees.

- The project on electoral campaign financing at the national level (8) led the grantee to develop a major new line of research on unfair advantage of incumbents at the provincial level, currently ongoing.

- Implementing the project on access to public information in the province of Santa Fe (10) enabled the grantee to become and remain an important player in this field.

#### IV Some lessons

Most of the projects on transparency and information carried out the planned activities and obtained the results they were seeking and also had an impact beyond the projects' narrow confines and short durations. Some lessons emerge on the factors of project success, other contributing factors, and PTF's role in supporting the grantees.

##### Success factors

Three factors were key determinants of project success: political will, stakeholder collaboration, and continuity of effort. Political will was of the essence. A major success factor of the two projects in the province of Santa Fe (projects 9 and 10 in Annex 1) was the leadership and continued commitment of the provincial government authorities and the responsiveness of public sector employees. An executive decree regulating access to public information provided a normative framework, the existing anticorruption agency became the implementing authority for the decree, and the two projects provided the agency with critical start-up support helping the agency become an effective and credible authority and channel to access public information.<sup>6</sup> In contrast, the project on the application of the federal decree on access to information (7) was designed and successfully implemented in times when the federal government and civil society emphasized increasing transparency and opening access to information, and in the short term the project contributed to improvements in public agencies. But soon thereafter the political context started to change, the federal government ceased to support further opening up, and access to information already public was increasingly curtailed. In this environment, the project recommendations for improvements in five ministries were never implemented.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> Santa Fe is the only sub-national government that is a member of the Latin American Red de Transparencia y Acceso a la Información (RTA). Other members are the national governments of Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Mexico, Peru, and Uruguay.

<sup>7</sup> These two projects illustrate the contrast between leadership and progress on access to public information at the provincial level and stagnation or regression at the federal level. The weak normative framework, lacking federal and provincial laws on access to public information, contributes to uneven progress among levels and branches of government.

Successful projects were based on collaboration among stakeholders in the context of existing rules. Ensuring at the onset that key players were able and willing to participate was critical. The project in Patagonia to use existing rules on access to public information to fight corruption (6) encouraged citizens to focus on issues of their own concern rather than predefined or generic categories. The communities became actively engaged in public policy issues involving corrupt practices, to an extent not envisioned in the original project design, which in turn resulted in concrete improvements of governance at provincial and municipal levels. In contrast, the project to strengthen the position of SMEs in the region of Buenos Aires to push back against bribery in public sector procurement (2) failed as the expectation that SMEs would be willing to join hands with NGOs to fight corruption proved unrealistic. An early lesson during the project was that SMEs would fight corruption only if supported by a public agency that gave assurances of new transparent business opportunities. To this end the project developed strategic relationships with several government agencies and with the association of SMEs, and established a facility to receive complaints from SMEs and provide guidance. Nonetheless, few SMEs sought assistance and not a single one filed a complaint. Three projects resorted to the judiciary to enforce rules on access to publication information (1, 3, 4), with mixed results and clarifications and appeals still pending.

Continuity of effort added considerably to project impact. All projects lasted 12 months or less with no follow-up grants, but most projects had an impact beyond their short lives. The more influential projects benefited from the principal government and civil society agents following up on the work initiated or supported by the project, in some cases with continued participation of the grantees. The project in Córdoba (4) launched the public debate on access to information, which was followed through by the provincial government eventually making administrative changes that enhanced transparency. The electoral platforms of the main political parties adopted principles on access to public information promoted by the project, leading to a growing number of municipalities enacting or considering ordinances on access

to information. The grantee continued to support the provincial government throughout these endeavors, and assisted the municipalities as they caught on.

#### Other contributing factors

No general conclusion can be reached on the importance of grantee size for project success. Arguably, however, two of the most successful projects with far-reaching effects were carried out by the smallest grantees. CEP (project 6) was essentially a one-man operation that managed to convene members of organizations throughout the Patagonia region to work together towards substantial results well beyond the immediate aims of the project. C365 (project 4) in association with FUNDEPS, altogether comprising two principals and nine associates, succeeded in moving initially unresponsive governments in the province of Córdoba to develop and eventually implement a string of improvements at province, city, and municipality levels. At the other end of the range, CIPPEC, a large operation with over 50 people and 100 projects and national presence, undertook three projects (7, 8, and 9), one of which (project 8, on electoral campaign financing) was also arguably one of the most influential in this cluster.

All projects seem to have been well matched to the capabilities of the grantees. Projects of national or federal government scope or comprising the large region of Buenos Aires were handled by organizations with a wide presence and a diverse skills mix capable of managing several complex projects simultaneously: CIPPEC (7, 8) and ACIJ, a medium sized organization (1, 2, and 3). Projects of provincial scope were mostly carried out one each by smaller organizations with a local or regional presence: C365 (4), CEP (6), and FEC (10). CIPPEC also did one provincial project (9), and there are no indications that a smaller outfit could not have done as well if available. One project (5) was undertaken by a provincial trade union, a creative but not especially successful venture.



While most projects supported NGOs seeking to change the behavior of public sector agencies, two projects departed from this model. In one project (2), the grantee sought to work with private companies in the fight against public sector corruption. In another project (5), the grantee, a trade union, sought to work with employers to improve the business and labor environment. Although innovative in the sense of NGOs working with the private sector instead of the public sector, results of both projects were mixed and do not yield significant lessons on how to further develop this approach.

### PTF role

PTF and FONTRA added value to the grantees in terms of funding and institutional support. For the smaller provincial grantees, PTF funding amounted to a significant or large part of their operating budget and total annual program. These grantees also valued highly the comfort and credibility gained from being supported by an international organization. While many other donors, as well as multilateral and bilateral aid organizations, have an established presence in Buenos Aires, they rarely reach out to the provinces. As for the larger grantees, PTF and FONTRA grants amounted to a small fraction of their operating budgets and work programs, and institutional support came at the end of a list of others already in place.

Some grantees, both small and large, gained from the projects in terms of their own development. The project in Santa Fe allowed FEC to strengthen its capabilities and generate new strategic alliances with entities in government, civil society, and the media. This, in turn, enabled FEC to continue assisting government promoting the right to public information and supporting improvements in governance beyond the project. In the wake of findings from the project on electoral campaign financing in 2011, CIPPEC developed a new line of research on unregulated uses of public resources by incumbents, and expects to disseminate initial results on time for the 2013 electoral period.

PTF also has potential to help with NGO networking. The conference held in Buenos Aires in December 2011 to wrap up the FONTRA program allowed grantees that had been working independently on related subjects to come together. CIPPEC and FEC, both of which carried out FONTRA-financed projects in the province of Santa Fe with the same government agency at the same time had had no contact during or after their projects, and only got to hear of each other's projects during the conference. As a result of meeting at the conference, FEC is now collaborating with C365 in Córdoba.

## V Conclusion

The main conclusion of the review is that most projects had a positive impact beyond their narrow definition and short duration, including projects that did not fully meet their immediate targets. This experience confirmed that small, short, one-off projects can make a difference even if they are barely a drop in the bucket of fighting corruption. Political will, stakeholder collaboration, and continuity of effort were key determinants of success in the short and longer terms. Effective matching of project scope and grantee capabilities also helped. To the limited extent tried, attempts to change private sector behavior were less successful than improving the public sector.

Like project costs, it is not always possible to separate the impact of projects supported by PTF and FONTRA grants from the impact of related projects or broader programs. For example, two projects funded by FONTRA simultaneously in the province of Santa Fe (9, 10) claim, quite plausibly, to have contributed to the same benefits. The project on electoral campaign financing (8) was an integral part of a CIPPEC program aimed at determining the extent to which the objectives of the electoral reform of 2009 were achieved regarding transparency, fair competition, and respect for political rights. This is a common problem in project analysis, but it does not impede identifying which projects had an impact even if their share of the aggregate impact cannot be determined.<sup>8</sup>

Assessing the impact of this cluster beyond the projects' narrow confines and short durations was limited by the paucity of relevant information. Grantee reports that place more emphasis on critical analysis and self evaluation rather than on descriptive detail, and PTF routine follow-up review some time (say, two years) after project completion, would have helped, and could be considered in the design of future PTF projects. The seven projects financed by

---

<sup>8</sup> This is a common problem. Standard practice in economic analysis of infrastructure projects, for example, compares any separable project costs and benefits to justify the use of resources, and then assesses whether the project contributed in the most cost-effective manner to the broader program of which it is a part.

FONTRA had been independently evaluated after submitting final reports. These evaluations, however, like the final reports submitted by the grantees, focused on the extent to which the projects carried out the activities they had planned, obtained the results they sought, and spent the grant as promised, as well as describing problems along the way and how these were overcome. The independent evaluations confirmed that by and large all this was achieved. The question of whether the projects mattered in the wider context of the quest for good governance and civil society participation, was not addressed. The projects financed directly by PTF include some comments on impact and broader lessons. Discussions with the grantees in the course of this review proved to be a valuable source of additional insight.

PTF helped strengthen small grantees in the provinces, and these were responsible for some of the projects with the greatest impact. Longer-term PTF support of successful small NGOs would enhance project and PTF impact. PTF could also play an important role facilitating NGO networking.

## References

CIPPEC 2012a. *CIPPEC Rinde Cuentas 2011*. Video. Available at <http://www.cippec.org>

CIPPEC 2012b. *Observatorio de la reforma electoral: monitoreo de la implementación de la reforma política en el proceso electoral de 2011*. April 2012. Available at <http://www.cippec.org>

Leira, Marcelo and Julia Pomares, 2012. *Reforma al Código Electoral Nacional: comentarios al proyecto de ley aprobado por la Cámara de Diputados*. Documentos de Políticas Públicas /Análisis No. 104. CIPPEC, Buenos Aires, April 2012. Available at [http://www.cippec.org/oear/sec\\_proyectoReforma/documentos.php](http://www.cippec.org/oear/sec_proyectoReforma/documentos.php)

Table 1  
PTF projects on transparency and information  
Objectives and impact

	Scope	Objectives	Impact
1	Federal government	Enhance transparency and effectiveness of auditing as a tool of external control of government agencies.	Sustained gains in transparency, civil society participation, and effectiveness of the government's external control system. Seven years after project completion, improvements in the auditing agency and the parliamentary commission to which it reports continue in place. Supporting legislation, however, did not pass.
2	Federal government and public sector agencies in Buenos Aires region	Strengthen the ability of private SME suppliers of public sector agencies to fight bribery.	Sustained increased transparency of procurement by two ministries and one state enterprise. Expanded SME market participation and exposure of corrupt practices public scrutiny. But the objective of getting private SMEs to actively participate with NGOs in fighting public sector corruption proved unrealistic.
3	Federal judiciary	Improve access to information on corruption cases in the courts, as a means to enhance accountability of government officials involved and increase community and media vigilance.	Sustained increase of judiciary transparency, public awareness, and civil society participation in the fight against corruption. These changes brought Argentina closer to internationally agreed principles. Two years after project completion, the court ruling that enabled public access to corruption cases remains in force, but it is subject to lower court restrictions and appeals underway.
4	Government of the province of Córdoba	Develop demand and procedures for obtaining public information from the state government of the province of Córdoba.	Following project completion, the provincial government established a transparency portal and financial management system that provide information earlier denied to the grantee. The city of Córdoba established an office of access to public information. Ordinances on access to public information were adopted in two other municipalities and are being discussed in eight more. Principles promoted by the project influenced the electoral platforms of the main parties.
5	Employee association and firms, province of Formosa	Support legal business tax practices, fair competition, and social responsibility by commercial firms.	Uncertain impact. No information whether tax plans, codes of ethics, and social responsibility plans developed with 21 firms were implemented.

	Scope	Objectives	Impact
6	Provincial and municipal governments of the region of Patagonia	Promote use of existing provincial and municipal rules on access to public information as tools for citizens and the media to fight corruption.	Debate on access to public information led to civil society involvement in broader government and community issues, which resulted in government actions beyond the intended project scope. Government actions included improved plans for protecting the coastal environment, a new city charter with provisions on access to information, a regional web site where citizens can find and request municipal information, and an ordinance on municipal schools with open access to financial, recruitment, and procurement information.
7	Federal government	Assess initial application of federal government decree of 2004 that regulates access to public information.	Uncertain impact of recommendations to five ministries to improve access to public information. In recent years the executive branch of the federal government has increasingly restricted access to public information. The grantee is working with the federal judiciary on related topics and is organizing a campaign to raise awareness on the right to public information.
8	Federal government	Evaluate how the new federal law of 2009 on election campaign financing was being applied at the national level for the first time during the election year 2011, and draw lessons for future elections.	Disseminating project results triggered unprecedented release of information by electoral authorities. Project findings were presented to congressional committee on constitutional affairs. Project lessons on campaign finance at the national level were applied to the design of electoral reforms in the provinces of Córdoba, Mendoza, Salta, and Santa Fe and the city of Buenos Aires. The project raised public awareness on unregulated use of public resources by incumbents. The grantee developed a new line of research on unfair advantage of incumbents at the provincial level, and expects to disseminate results during the electoral year 2013.
9	Government and public enterprises in the province of Santa Fe	Improve transparency and competitiveness of public sector enterprises in the province of Santa Fe through implementation in two enterprises of the provincial government decree on access to public information.	The provincial government eventually adopted mandatory standards of access to information in all state enterprises and is developing a provincial portal of transparency and public information. Training material and case study developed during the project continued in use two years later.
10	Government of the province of Santa Fe	Train social leaders and government officials in the application of the executive decree that regulates access to public information in the province of Santa Fe.	Enabled the anti-corruption agency to become an effective and credible authority and channel to obtain public information, and mobilized public participation in using this channel. Practice and dissemination material remains in use two years after project completion. But budget limitations prevent the agency from sustaining the public awareness campaign. A new World Bank project is helping the agency develop a provincial portal for active transparency and IT support facilities. The project enabled the grantee to become and remain a significant player in the field of access to public information.

Table 3.2  
Distribution of categories of impact among projects

impact	project									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Results sustained at least two years after project completion	√	√	√							√
Implementation of initiatives or recommendations	x		x							
Effects beyond project scope		√		√		√		√	√	
Continued use of project tools									√	√
Lasting development of grantee capabilities								√		√



## Annex 1

## Argentina: Projects on transparency and information

Project		Organization	Grant	Discussant	
				Grantee	Other
1	Strategies of participatory control and institutional strengthening of the federal auditing agency	Asociación Civil por la Igualdad y la Justicia (ACIJ)	PTF 2004 USD 21,900	Ezequiel Nino enino@acij.org.ar	
2	Constructing change: tools for small and medium enterprises to combat corruption		FONTRA 2009 USD 20,000		
3	Access to information and ex-post control of corruption		FONTRA 2008 USD 20,000		
4	Accessibility and transparency: promoting the right to access public information in the province of Córdoba, Argentina	Fundación Ciudadanos 365 (C365)	FONTRA 2010 USD 12,000	Mariano Mosquera mosquera@ciudadanos365.com	Javier Cámara Journalist, <i>La Voz del Interior</i> javierenriquecamara@gmail.com
5	Development of corporate social responsibility among companies in the province of Formosa based on non-corrupt and transparent fiscal practices	Centro de Empleados de Comercio – Filial Formosa Argentina (CEC-FSA)	FONTRA 2010 USD 15,000	no response	
6	Access to information: main tool to control corruption in Patagonia	Centro de Estudios Patagónicos (CEP)	FONTRA 2010 USD 16,890	no response	
7	Monitoring access to public information in federal government agencies	Centro de Políticas Públicas para la Equidad y el Crecimiento (CIPPEC)	PTF 2004 USD 19,082	Sandra Elena selena@cippec.org	
8	Monitoring campaign finances during the 2011 elections		PTF 2011 USD 40,000	Julia Pomares jpomares@cippec.org	
9	Decree 692/09: promoting its correct application in state enterprises of Santa Fe		FONTRA 2010 USD 17,996	Sandra Elena selena@cippec.org	Paulo Friguglietti Director Provincial de Anticorrupción y Transparencia del Sector Público pfriguglietti@santafe.gov.ar
10	Design of a system of dissemination and training to exercise the right of access to public information in the province of Santa Fe	Fundación Ejercicio Ciudadano (FEC)	FONTRA 2010 USD 15,800	Lucas Barberis contacto@ejerciciociudadano.org.ar	

## Annex 2

### Argentina: Projects on transparency and information

#### Implementing organizations

Organization	Est.	Coverage	Characteristics	Main areas of interest	Pr.
Asociación Civil por la Igualdad y la Justicia (ACIJ) <a href="http://acij.org.ar">http://acij.org.ar</a>	2002	National	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nonpartisan, nonprofit.</li> <li>• Dedicated to defending the rights of the most disadvantaged groups of society and strengthening democracy.</li> <li>• Three directors, 22 staff, 14 volunteers (2011).</li> <li>• Budget USD 0.6 m (2010)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community legal action</li> <li>• Citizen participation in the fight against corruption</li> <li>• Low-income housing rights and development</li> <li>• Strengthening democratic institutions</li> <li>• Education equality</li> </ul>	1, 2, 3
Fundación Ciudadanos 365 (C365) jointly with Fundación para el Desarrollo de Políticas Sustentables (FUNDEPS) <a href="http://www.ciudadanos365.com">http://www.ciudadanos365.com</a> <a href="http://www.fundeps.org">http://www.fundeps.org</a>		Province of Córdoba	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• C365 works with governments and civil society organizations in applied research, training and communication campaigns.</li> <li>• FUNDEPS provides training, advocacy, research, strategic litigation, and cooperation among the state, private sector, and civil society.</li> <li>• Two principals and nine associates (2012).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Córdoba Transparente, a joint program promoting access to public information, monitoring electoral processes, and raising awareness on the fight against corruption.</li> </ul>	4
Centro de Empleados de Comercio – Filial Formosa Argentina (CEC-FSA) <a href="http://www.cecfsa.com.ar">http://www.cecfsa.com.ar</a>	1927	City of Formosa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Trade union of commercial sector employees</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Represents and defends member interests. Promotes member education and job training.</li> </ul>	5
Centro de Estudios Patagónicos Participación y Democracia (CEP) <a href="http://www.estudiospatagonicos.org.ar">www.estudiospatagonicos.org.ar</a>		Provinces of Patagonia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Comprises members of organizations of the Patagonian provinces.</li> <li>• Develops technical actions to improve the quality of public policy institutions.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Study of transparency and participation in government at the provincial and local levels</li> </ul>	6

Organization	Est.	Coverage	Characteristics	Main areas of interest	
Centro de Implementación de Políticas Públicas para la Equidad y el Crecimientos (CIPPEC) <a href="http://www.cippec.org">www.cippec.org</a>	2000	National	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Independent, nonpartisan, nonprofit.</li> <li>• Seeks to improve the quality of public policy to enhance equity and growth.</li> <li>• 48 staff and 16 volunteers (2012).</li> <li>• 101 projects (2011)</li> <li>• USD 2.8m budget (2011).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social, economic, and institutional development and public administration.</li> <li>• Programs in education, social protection, fiscal policy, global integration and productive development, justice, transparency, government policy and management, local development, and monitoring and evaluation.</li> </ul>	7, 8, 9
Fundación Ejercicio Ciudadano (FEC) <a href="http://www.ejercicio-ciudadano.org.ar">http://www.ejercicio-ciudadano.org.ar</a>	1994	Province of Santa Fe	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nonpartisan, nonprofit, volunteer-based.</li> <li>• Promotes strengthening of democratic institutions and active citizen engagement in the public interest.</li> <li>• About 40 volunteers and 3 staff (2011).</li> <li>• Budget about USD 60,000 (2009).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Electoral transparency - data banks, electoral observatory, campaign finance monitoring</li> <li>• Government transparency – local governance, municipal monitoring, access to public information</li> <li>• Community development – youth programs, mediation training</li> </ul>	10