How do citizens fight corruption successfully?
Stories and Lessons from Asia

Dr. Vinay Bhargava
Chief Technical Adviser
Partnership for Transparency Fund
vbhargava@ptfund.org

Seminar at the Asia Development Bank - Governance Community of Practice

10th July 2014, Manila, the Philippines

www.ptfund.org
The Partnership for Transparency Fund mobilizes expertise and resources to provide advice and small grants to civil society organizations to engage citizens in actions to remove corruption in the public sector.

ESSENTIAL FACTS:
- Non-profit international NGO
- Run by highly experienced volunteers
- Registered as a foundation with SEC in the Philippines

www.ptfund.org
Why it is important to engage citizens in the fight against corruption?

How can citizens can fight corruption successfully? *Real world examples from India, the Philippines and Nepal*

Theory of change and good practices in citizen engagement for good governance and anti-corruption

Operational implications for multilateral and bilateral donors

www.ptfund.org
The Temple of Good Governance Rests on Many Pillars

DONOR FOCUS AREAS

NATIONAL INTEGRITY SYSTEM

Rule of Law
Sustainable Development
Quality of Life

Legislature
Executive
Judiciary
Public Sector
Law Enforcement
Electoral Mgt. Body
Ombudsman
Audit Institution
Anti-Corruption Agencies
Political Parties
Media
Civil Society
Business

Source: Transparency International
Public Confidence in State Led Anti-Corruption Efforts

Extent to which affected by corruption on a scale of 1-5 (extremely corrupt)

- Political parties: 3.9
- Police: 3.7
- Public officials/Civil servants: 3.6
- Parliament/Legislature: 3.6
- Judiciary: 3.6
- Business/Private sector: 3.3
- Medical and health services: 3.3
- Education system: 3.2
- Media: 3.1
- Military: 2.9
- NGOs: 2.7
- Religious bodies: 2.6

Institutions most often supported by donors to improve governance and growth are relatively more corrupt and part of the problem.

Source: TII- Global Corruption Barometer 2013
Corruption is Getting Worse: More Needs to be Done

- Corruption ranked as the world’s top problem in a 2014 survey of over 66,000 people in 65 nations

- The majority of people surveyed in 107 nations by Transparency International in 2013 believe that their government is ineffective at fighting corruption and corruption in their country is getting worse
What Can Be Done?: More Participatory Governance

Current Anti-Corruption Support is Unbalanced

Citizen-led Programs

Independent Accountability Institutions

Executive Branch Programs

Provide More Balanced Support for Anti-Corruption Programs

Citizen led (Social accountability) programs

Independent Institutions of Accountability

Executive Branch Programs

www.ptfund.org
SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY PROGRAMS HAVE COME A LONG WAY SINCE THE 2004 WDR...

www.ptfund.org
Now the three stories...

- Desperate housewives of Khariar, Odisha, India
- The case of missing medicines in the Philippines
- Disappearing forests in Nepal

www.ptfund.org
Desperate Housewives of Khariar, Odisha, India

National Rural Health Mission promises free health services to poor.

DENIED

- Hospital child delivery
- Vaccinations
- Widower pensions
- TB medicines
- Pre/Post Natal care
- Nutrition supplements

www.ptfund.org
## Khariar, India: Actions And Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Baseline survey of corruption practices and magnitude</td>
<td>• Increased responsiveness in services delivered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Media outreach and workshops</td>
<td>• Corrupt officials suspended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public rallies against corruption</td>
<td>• Reduction in bribe paying experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Formed citizens against corruption forum in 64 villages + network</td>
<td>• Citizen participation in service delivery planning increased</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Capacity building of forum members</td>
<td>• Free medicines and health service entitlements delivery improved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Social audits + public hearings</td>
<td>• Increased empowerment and involvement of citizen groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Impact monitoring tool</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• RTI applications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Engaged with public officials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Case Of Missing Medicines In The Philippines

PROBLEM

Many poor households denied access to low cost and yet high quality medicines from Department of Health due to:

- Inefficient procurement processes
- Inaccurate deliveries and poor distribution
- Inadequate warehousing and stocking of essential medicines
- Corruption

www.ptfund.org
## Actions

- Mobilized and trained volunteers and CSOs within communities
- Volunteers checked various reports used by hospitals and observed procurement process
- Volunteers submitted ‘Observers Diagnostic Reports’
- Compared market prices to prices in different hospitals
- Participated in Integrity Development Committee

## Results

- Increased transparency in public bidding lowered prices
- Medicines were delivered on time in right quantity to target groups
- Improvements in warehousing and storage
- Bid awards committees more open and receptive to observers
- DOH in the top three least corrupt govt. institutions
- Savings ten time the project cost
The Saga of Disappearing Forests in Nepal

*Forest Act of 1993 calls for creation of community forest user groups (CFUG) to help protect and manage community forests.*

PTF Partner CSO (Forest Action) investigation in Dhanketi, Morang District found:

- Illegal logging
- Local elites used smugglers to poach timber
- Organized illegal timber network
- Collusion between local elites, CFUG members and local officials

www.ptfund.org
### Nepal: Actions and Results
(CSO Partner: Forest Action)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Dialogue with CFUG members to confront corruption</td>
<td>• Increased community awareness and willingness to confront</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public outreach thru TV, FM radio, local newspapers</td>
<td>• New local rules for CFUGs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Network of CFUGs and CFUG watchdog committee</td>
<td>• Watchdog committee deterring corruption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public audits and hearings</td>
<td>• CFUG member performance improved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Good practice guidelines for CFUGs prepared and piloted</td>
<td>• Public protests against corrupt officials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Policy briefs</td>
<td>• Illegal logging decreased by 80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

www.ptfund.org
These stories are illustrative of thousands of similar successes of citizens fighting corruption around the world.
Four Frequently Asked Questions About Citizens Fighting Corruption

1. How can citizens overcome the asymmetry of power between them and the state?

2. What are the theories of change underlying social accountability as a means of improving development outcomes?

3. Is citizen engagement an alternative to state led efforts?

4. What works and what does not in citizen led efforts to improve governance?

www.ptfund.org
Overcoming Asymmetry Of Power: Strategy Matters

- Use your strengths
- Know your opponent’s vulnerabilities
- Have an attack plan
- Take aim and execute
- Celebrate

[Image of David vs. Goliath]


www.ptfund.org
Theory of Change for Citizens Fighting Corruption Successfully

- Community information and capacity building support
- Increased community awareness, capability and willingness to participate
- Communities express concerns and monitor government functioning

Governance outcomes improved

- Increased public pressure on authorities to respond, change behavior, and reduce corruption
- Community views and monitoring results shared with authorities, media and general public
Are Citizen Led Anti-Corruption Programs A Substitute To State Led Efforts?

NO

• They are third line of defense after:
  – Executive branch anti-corruption programs
  – Independent institutions of accountability

• Needed as the first two lines are not enough

• Play complementary and watch dog roles

www.ptfund.org
What works and how?
PTF’s 5 Point Formula for Success

1. Raise Community awareness of their rights and benefits

2. Form and empower citizen groups to engage/organize collective action

3. Citizen groups monitor performance and share information to create pressure for better results

4. Citizen groups constructively engage with service providers to demand increased responsiveness

5. Citizen groups periodically monitor changes and provide feedback to community and authorities

CSOS play a key role as social intermediary at all stages

www.ptfund.org
What does not work and why?

Citizen led programs break down or fail when....

• Citizens do not have sufficient information to participate and monitor
• Opportunity costs of participation are high
• Citizens fear free-riders and are less forthcoming for collective actions
• Probability of success is perceived to be low
• Elite capture happens
• Politicians and/or providers lack incentives (e.g. popularity gains, increased salary, increased social recognition, resources to be responsive)

www.ptfund.org
In the right contexts citizen led social accountability initiatives can contribute to:

– Increased state or institutional responsiveness
– Lowering of corruption
– Building new democratic space for citizen engagement
– Empowering local voices
– Better budget utilization and better delivery of services
• Theory of change is still under development
• Many studies focus on one locality and are anecdotal
• Much literature focuses on the effectiveness of implementation rather than impact
• Context matters: positive impact in one setting is often not corroborated and some times even contradicted
Engaging citizens to improve governance and fight corruption have a better chance to produce good results when one or more of the following contextual factors exist or can be ensured during implementation.

| Public access to information | Reasonable amount of media freedom | Space for civil society to operate and CSO capacity | Incentives for politicians/officials to be responsive | Citizen’s willingness to participate |

Make sure to assess the context when considering citizen-led anti-corruption initiatives.
Provide More Balanced Support for Anti-Corruption Programs

- Citizen led programs
- Independent Institutions of Accountability
- Executive Branch Programs

In my view donors should...

Increase support for such programs

Most current funding

www.ptfund.org
Thank You for Your Attention

vbhargava@ptfund.org
Facebook: PTFund

vinaybhargav@gmail.com
Facebook: Global Vinay

www.ptfund.org
Reserve Slides
## Zapping Mosquitos and Corruption in Lahore

### Problems

- Workers sell Anti Dengue insecticides and/or refuse to spray without bribes
- Police and hospitals do not respond in timely manner/ask bribes
- TII 34% of respondents in Pakistan reported paying a bribe when availing at least one of 8 public services (Source: TI International Survey 2012)

### Solutions

- City workers submit before and after photos thru smart phones
- Photos mapped and made public for citizen feedback
- 1.3 m volunteers sign up in Punjab province to provide feedback on satisfaction with public services
- Feedback Data mapped and Actions taken to improve

Source: *Economist Magazine, 1st June 2013*
Citizens Fighting Corruption: What works and how?

1. Raise awareness

- Application Process
- Plays and videos
- Help sources
- Print materials
- Grievance Redress
- Mass Media
- Key Officials
- Community Meetings
- Rights and Entitlements

www.ptfund.org
Citizens Fighting Corruption: What works and how?

2. Organize Collective Action

- Train Volunteers
- Mobilize/select Volunteers
- SMS Texting
- Crowdsourcing
- Public rallies
- Media campaigns
- Postcard Mailings
- Petitions
- Access Information
- Road shows
- Multi-stakeholder Meetings with Authorities and Media

www.ptfund.org
Citizens Fighting Corruption: What works and how?

- Community Score Card
- Independent Budget Analysis
- Community Oversight
- ICT enabled monitoring and feedback
- Public Expenditure Tracking
- Integrity Pacts
- Citizen Report Card
- Social Audit
- Participatory Physical Audit
- Compliance with Citizen Charters

3. Monitor Performance and Share Results

www.ptfund.org
Citizens Fighting Corruption: What works and how?

- Citizen/User membership in decision making bodies
- Advocate for supply side reforms
- Public Hearings
- Participatory Planning
- Community contracting
- Focus Group Discussions
- Participatory budgeting
- Community Management
- User Management Committees

www.ptfund.org
Citizens Fighting Corruption: What works and how?

5. Provide Feedback Periodically

Local politicians
Communities
Service providers
Volunteers
Coalition Members
Media
High Level Officials
Individuals
Donors

www.ptfund.org
How Scalable and Replicable are the “Citizens Fighting Corruption” Approaches?

Research is going on...

Citizen voice and state accountability
Towards theories of change that embrace contextual dynamics

Fletcher Tembo

Incentives and Accountability Mechanisms to Improve Service Provision: Global Experiences from J-PAL
Iqbal Dhamiwal and Shawn Powers, J-PAL
Martina Björkman Nykvist, SSE and J-PAL
27 October 2011

Synthesis report
Review of impact and effectiveness of transparency and accountability initiatives
Rosemary McEve & John Gaventa

Replicability and scalability is a huge challenge and is context dependent.

www.ptfund.org